

## Federal Aviation Administration, DOT

## § 13.231

judge at or before the time specified in the subpoena for compliance. The applicant shall describe, in detail, the basis for the application to quash or modify the subpoena including, but not limited to, a statement that the testimony, document, or tangible evidence is not relevant to the proceeding, that the subpoena is not reasonably tailored to the scope of the proceeding, or that the subpoena is unreasonable and oppressive. A motion to quash or modify the subpoena will stay the effect of the subpoena pending a decision by the administrative law judge on the motion.

(c) *Enforcement of subpoena.* Upon a showing that a person has failed or refused to comply with a subpoena, a party may apply to the local federal district court to seek judicial enforcement of the subpoena in accordance with 49 U.S.C. 46104 in cases under the Federal aviation statute.

[Amdt. 13-21, 55 FR 27575, July 3, 1990, as amended at 71 FR 70465, Dec. 5, 2006]

### § 13.229 Witness fees.

(a) *General.* Unless otherwise authorized by the administrative law judge, the party who applies for a subpoena to compel the attendance of a witness at a deposition or hearing, or the party at whose request a witness appears at a deposition or hearing, shall pay the witness fees described in this section.

(b) *Amount.* Except for an employee of the agency who appears at the direction of the agency, a witness who appears at a deposition or hearing is entitled to the same fees and mileage expenses as are paid to a witness in a court of the United States in comparable circumstances.

### § 13.230 Record.

(a) *Exclusive record.* The transcript of all testimony in the hearing, all exhibits received into evidence, and all motions, applications, requests, and rulings shall constitute the exclusive record for decision of the proceedings and the basis for the issuance of any orders in the proceeding. Any proceedings regarding the disqualification of an administrative law judge shall be included in the record.

(b) *Examination and copying of record.* Any person may examine the record at the Hearing Docket, Federal Aviation

Administration, 600 Independence Avenue, SW., Wilbur Wright Building—Room 2014, Washington, DC 20591. Documents may also be examined and copied at the U.S. Department of Transportation, Docket Operations, West Building Ground Floor, Room W12-140, 1200 New Jersey Avenue, SE., Washington, DC 20590. Any person may have a copy of the record after payment of reasonable costs to copy the record.

[Docket No. 18884, 44 FR 63723, Nov. 5, 1979, as amended at 70 FR 8238, Feb. 18, 2005; 72 FR 68474, Dec. 5, 2007]

### § 13.231 Argument before the administrative law judge.

(a) *Arguments during the hearing.* During the hearing, the administrative law judge shall give the parties a reasonable opportunity to present arguments on the record supporting or opposing motions, objections, and rulings if the parties request an opportunity for argument. The administrative law judge may request written arguments during the hearing if the administrative law judge finds that submission of written arguments would be reasonable.

(b) *Final oral argument.* At the conclusion of the hearing and before the administrative law judge issues an initial decision in the proceedings, the parties are entitled to submit oral proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, exceptions to rulings of the administrative law judge, and supporting arguments for the findings, conclusions, or exceptions. At the conclusion of the hearing, a party may waive final oral argument.

(c) *Posthearing briefs.* The administrative law judge may request written posthearing briefs before the administrative law judge issues an initial decision in the proceedings if the administrative law judge finds that submission of written arguments would be reasonable. If a party files a written posthearing brief, the party shall include proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, exceptions to rulings of the administrative law judge, and supporting arguments for the findings, conclusions, or exceptions. The administrative law judge shall give the parties a reasonable opportunity, not more than 30 days after receipt of the

transcript, to prepare and submit the briefs.

**§ 13.232 Initial decision.**

(a) *Contents.* The administrative law judge shall issue an initial decision at the conclusion of the hearing. In each oral or written decision, the administrative law judge shall include findings of fact and conclusions of law, and the grounds supporting those findings and conclusions, upon all material issues of fact, the credibility of witnesses, the applicable law, any exercise of the administrative law judge's discretion, the amount of any civil penalty found appropriate by the administrative law judge, and a discussion of the basis for any order issued in the proceedings. The administrative law judge is not required to provide a written explanation for rulings on objections, procedural motions, and other matters not directly relevant to the substance of the initial decision. If the administrative law judge refers to any previous unreported or unpublished initial decision, the administrative law judge shall make copies of that initial decision available to all parties and the FAA decisionmaker.

(b) *Oral decision.* Except as provided in paragraph (c) of this section, at the conclusion of the hearing, the administrative law judge shall issue the initial decision and order orally on the record.

(c) *Written decision.* The administrative law judge may issue a written initial decision not later than 30 days after the conclusion of the hearing or submission of the last posthearing brief if the administrative law judge finds that issuing a written initial decision is reasonable. The administrative law judge shall serve a copy of any written initial decision on each party.

(d) *Order assessing civil penalty.* Unless appealed pursuant to § 13.233 of this subpart, the initial decision issued by the administrative law judge shall be considered an order assessing civil penalty if the administrative law judge finds that an alleged violation occurred and determines that a civil penalty, in an amount found appropriate by the administrative law judge, is warranted.

**§ 13.233 Appeal from initial decision.**

(a) *Notice of appeal.* A party may appeal the initial decision, and any decision not previously appealed pursuant to § 13.219, by filing a notice of appeal with the FAA decisionmaker. A party must file the notice of appeal in the FAA Hearing Docket using the appropriate address listed in § 13.210(a). A party shall file the notice of appeal not later than 10 days after entry of the oral initial decision on the record or service of the written initial decision on the parties and shall serve a copy of the notice of appeal on each party.

(b) *Issues on appeal.* In any appeal from a decision of an administrative law judge, the FAA decisionmaker considers only the following issues:

(1) Whether each finding of fact is supported by a preponderance of reliable, probative, and substantial evidence;

(2) Whether each conclusion of law is made in accordance with applicable law, precedent, and public policy; and

(3) Whether the administrative law judge committed any prejudicial errors that support the appeal.

(c) *Perfecting an appeal.* Unless otherwise agreed by the parties, a party shall perfect an appeal, not later than 50 days after entry of the oral initial decision on the record or service of the written initial decision on the party, by filing an appeal brief with the FAA decisionmaker.

(1) *Extension of time by agreement of the parties.* The parties may agree to extend the time for perfecting the appeal with the consent of the FAA decisionmaker. If the FAA decisionmaker grants an extension of time to perfect the appeal, the appellate docket clerk shall serve a letter confirming the extension of time on each party.

(2) *Written motion for extension.* If the parties do not agree to an extension of time for perfecting an appeal, a party desiring an extension of time may file a written motion for an extension with the FAA decisionmaker and shall serve a copy of the motion on each party. The FAA decisionmaker may grant an extension if good cause for the extension is shown in the motion.